



Northwest Territories Environment and Natural Resources

NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: June 3-12, 2009	TIME:
NAME: Bathurst Caribou Calving Ground Survey SURVEY METHODS AND RESULTS	PEOPLE INVOLVED: Alicia Kelly, Dean Cluff, Jennifer Bailey, 2 Akaticho Members: Ron Fatt, Noel Doctor, Tli Cho Government: Frank
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Jan Adamczewski	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR conducted a survey June 3-12, 2009 to get an estimate number of breeding females in the Bathurst Caribou herd on the calving grounds.	
ENR RECOMMENDATIONS \ COMMENTS:	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS:	



NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: July 9-10, 2009	TIME:
NAME:	COMPANY: Dene Nation Summer Gathering
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the people of the Dene Nation Summer Gathering in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATION: ENR did not make a presentation because of lack of time. They did however, bring graphs and maps for people to look over. In addition, hats, thermoses, and mugs with the "respect the caribou" logo were handed out. There was a discussion on the side and ENR representatives were there to answer any questions.	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS: We acknowledge what is happening and agree to do our part when the time comes.	



NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: July 16, 2009	TIME:
NAME: Grand Chief George Mackenzie	COMPANY: Tlicho Chief
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Fred Mandeville	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the Grand Chief in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATION: ENR did a presentation on survey methods and results that were gathered June 3-12, 2009. The purpose of the survey was to estimate the number of breeding females in the Bathurst Caribou herd on the calving grounds (1986-2009).	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS: The Grand Chief would like an update on the Caribou survey once complete. He also wants the issue brought up to the elders and talk to young folks. The Tlicho is also not to issue outfitting tags.	

**NORTH SLAVE REGION
CONSULTATION LOG**

DATE: Late July	TIME:
NAME:	COMPANY: Tli Cho- Behchoko
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Lance Schmidt	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the Tli Cho Government in Behchoko in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR RECOMMENDATIONS \ COMMENTS: ENR did not make a presentation because of lack of time. They did however, bring graphs and maps for people to look over. In addition, hats, thermoses, and mugs with the "respect the caribou" logo were handed out. There was a discussion on the side and ENR representatives were there to answer any questions.	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS:	

**NORTH SLAVE REGION
CONSULTATION LOG**

DATE: August 14, 2009	TIME:
NAME:	COMPANY: NSMA
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Fred Mandeville	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the NSMA in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATION: ENR did a presentation on survey methods and results that were gathered June 3-12, 2009. The purpose of the survey was to estimate the number of breeding females in the Bathurst Caribou herd on the calving grounds (1986-2009).	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS: Believed the government is not doing anything about the wolves. There needs to be more collars. Global warming and other climate issues are affecting the population negatively. We need to work together as it is too late to blame someone.	



NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: Mid August	TIME:
NAME: Bertha	COMPANY: Tlicho
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Fred Mandeville	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the Tlicho in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATION: ENR did a presentation on survey methods and results that were gathered June 3-12, 2009. The purpose of the survey was to estimate the number of breeding females in the Bathurst Caribou herd on the calving grounds (1986-2009).	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS: There needs to be more education on the issue at hand. Enforcements need to be placed, and conservation of the caribou needs to start. They need to be protected.	



NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: August 21, 2009	TIME:
NAME: Bertha Jennifer Kerri	COMPANY: Tlicho
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Fred Mandeville	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the Tlicho in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATION: ENR did a presentation on survey methods and results that were gathered June 3-12, 2009. The purpose of the survey was to estimate the number of breeding females in the Bathurst Caribou herd on the calving grounds (1986-2009).	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS: What are the effects of killing too many bulls? We don't want to create hardship. Don't want total elimination. We have decided to postpone the fall hunt. Commercial tags. Aboriginal should not hunt cows.	



Northwest Territories Environment and Natural Resources

NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: August	TIME:
NAME:	COMPANY: Annual Spiritual Gathering- Reliance
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the people of Reliance at the Annual Spiritual Gathering in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATION: ENR did not make a presentation because of lack of time. They did however, bring graphs and maps for people to look over. In addition, hats, thermoses, and mugs with the "respect the caribou" logo were handed out. There was a discussion on the side and ENR representatives were there to answer any questions.	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS:	

NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: September 9, 2009	TIME:
NAME:	COMPANY: Tlicho Working Group
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Fred Mandeville	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the Tlicho Working Group in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATION: ENR did a presentation on survey methods and results that were gathered June 3-12, 2009. The purpose of the survey was to estimate the number of breeding females in the Bathurst Caribou herd on the calving grounds (1986-2009).	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS: We want to try to maintain 20 collars. What do other users think? In the last 20 years, the caribou have been in the same area.	



NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: September 24, 2009	TIME:
NAME: Elders Workshop	COMPANY: Tli cho Working Group
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Fred Mandeville	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the Tli cho Working Group to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATION: ENR did a presentation on survey methods and results that were gathered June 3-12, 2009. The purpose of the survey was to estimate the number of breeding females in the Bathurst Caribou herd on the calving grounds (1986-2009).	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS: Joint proposal. We brief caribou leaders. 32 000, need to stop hunting. Another workshop will be held in October.	



NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: September 26-27, 2009	TIME:
NAME: Bertha Rabesca-Zoe- Tli Cho Alfonz Nitsiza- Tli Cho Kerri Garner- Tli Cho Eddie Erasmus- Tli Cho	COMPANY: Calgary Technical Meeting
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Jan Adamczewski, Wekweeti biologist	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the people of the Calgary Technical Meeting in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR RECOMMENDATIONS \ COMMENTS: The purpose of this meeting was to review and discuss possible causes and explanations for the caribou decline with other scientists.	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS:	



NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: September 29, 2009	TIME:
NAME:	COMPANY: Behchoko- Wildlife Workshop
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Fred Mandeville	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with Behchoko at the Wildlife Workshop in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATION \ COMMENTS: ENR did a presentation on survey methods and results that were gathered June 3-12, 2009. The purpose of the survey was to estimate the number of breeding females in the Bathurst Caribou herd on the calving grounds (1986-2009). We said we would give them money as per their request (to pay for Gameti workshop. Because of the location change, the elders were told they could bring in delegates .	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS: Looking for money for a workshop in Gameti. Elders are not familiar with ENR policies. The meeting was supposed to be in Wekweeti, which allowed the elders from there to talk. How many caribou are being killed by elders in the NWT? What happened to the meat from the caribou that were found dead at the mine?	

DATE: October 1-2, 5-6, 2009	TIME:
NAME:	COMPANY: Decline and Recovery of the Bathurst Caribou Herd Workshop
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Jan Adamczewski, Danny Beaulieu, Ernie Campbell, Susan Fleck, Alicia Kelly, Lance Schmidt, Cate Sills	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: The goal of the workshop was to review the critical decline in the Bathurst herd and to explore possible management options for recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATIONS \ COMMENTS: -ENR gave a presentation on caribou population cycles during the past 120, as well as showed results from a survey done in June 2009 on the Bathurst calving ground. ENR also presented a graph and information about annual surveys of wolf dens at the south end of the Bathurst summer range from data collected since 1996. -There are many factors affecting numbers of Barren-Ground caribou; weather, green-up, and plants caribou eat, hunter harvest, mining and industrial development, wolves and other predators, and fire on the winter range. - ENR pointed out that the department's fire program was due for a review and there would be community meetings that people could participate in. - Asked participants if they had alternatives if they were unable to hunt caribou. - Final words "We are the descendents of the caribou. They caribou once helped our people to recover- now it's our turn to help them." – Danny Beaulieu	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS: - Human impacts on caribou can be managed, hunting used to be different- hunting today is less respectful of caribou - Exploration and mining have had negative effects- helicopters used during exploration, transport trucks servicing mines, blasting. - Caribou avoid the mines and further research is needed to understand mining effects. - Need to protect calving grounds in the NWT and Nunavut. - Concerned the small caribou population size, predation by wolves and bears could have stronger negative impact on Bathurst herd- measures be taken to control wolf population. (Others support the conservation of wolves given wolf numbers have declined in response to decline of caribou.) - Large wildfires in recent years have destroyed areas of important caribou winter habitat- remaining corridors of habitat through burned areas should be given increased fire protection for migration and feeding purposes in the winter. (Others thought fire was a natural part of landscape and controlling fires could lead to larger, more destructive ones.) - We need to "walk together" to work collaboratively to conserve the caribou. - Times of scarce caribou have happened before and other animals were hunted during these times. – several alternative sources of meat for most communities. - Difficult situation for communities such as Lutsel K'e and the TliCho- would need help - We can help, but the GNWT and partners need to get every community to share information.	

- Communities that will have real hardship if they cannot hunt caribou need to be addressed.
 - Public education is very important- hunters can change what they do, but need the information to do so.
 - Action needs to be taken sooner, for the sake of future generations- what will they say about us and what we did at this critical time?
 - Hunter harvest needs to be managed, but we need to protect calving grounds and winter ranges.
 - Predators may need to be managed.
-

NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: October 14, 2009	TIME:
NAME:	COMPANY: Gameti
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Fred Mandeville	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the people of Gameti in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATION: ENR did a presentation on survey methods and results that were gathered June 3-12, 2009. The purpose of the survey was to estimate the number of breeding females in the Bathurst Caribou herd on the calving grounds (1986-2009). In addition, there were calculations of breeding cows (minus detailed statistics), estimations of Bathurst Herd size from breeding female numbers, and the overall population size. The total herd size is based on photo sensus, which is based on breeding cows and the ratio of cow/calf and cow/bull.	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS: We are concerned about the 3 herds being combined. Have met with other users about this. The talk should only be on the Bathurst herd. Interested in how ENR does the count? Why do we only count females? Why was there no discussion on sick and injured caribou? We don't mind wasting the caribou when it comes to them suffering. We would like to see more monitoring at the mine sites. Why the reduced population? People know August is the time to hunt. People are being chartered by plane and chopper to the caribou now. We want the survey done by walking the land. We will not be pushed by the Government. Treaty from 1921 stated there will be no restrictions in wildlife harvesting. Outfitters only want the caribou for their head. Think of the future for young people. Are the people who monitor check stations being properly trained? We would like to see more frequent meetings with youth.	

NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: Late October	TIME:
NAME:	COMPANY: Dene Nation- Dettah
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Lance Schmidt, Ernie Campbell, Jan Adamczewski	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the Dene Nation in Dettah in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATION: ENR did a presentation on survey methods and results that were gathered June 3-12, 2009. The purpose of the survey was to estimate the number of breeding females in the Bathurst Caribou herd on the calving grounds (1986-2009). In addition, there were calculations of breeding cows (minus detailed statistics), estimations of Bathurst Herd size from breeding female numbers, and the overall population size. The total herd size is based on photo sensus, which is based on breeding cows and the ratio of cow/calf and cow/bull.	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS:	

NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: November 16, 2009	TIME:
NAME:	COMPANY: Fort Providence
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Fred Mandeville	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the people of Fort Providence in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATION: ENR did a presentation on survey methods and results that were gathered June 3-12, 2009. The purpose of the survey was to estimate the number of breeding females in the Bathurst Caribou herd on the calving grounds (1986-2009). In addition, there were calculations of breeding cows (minus detailed statistics), estimations of Bathurst Herd size from breeding female numbers, and the overall population size. The total herd size is based on photo sensus, which is based on breeding cows and the ratio of cow/calf and cow/bull.	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS: As of three years ago when the decline started, we no longer support community hunts. What caused the decline? We would like to see a "no fly" zone during peak caribou seasons. What about the injured caribou? Are you doing anything about the caribou predators? The inexperienced hunters out there need to be educated. Is there any information on past declines? What would replace the caribou? And who will pay? Winter Road is narrow, only 200 meters. Why is the Reindeer number not affected? Fines should be increased for hunting infractions. Preserve the meat. Road kill should be salvaged and distributed. We would like a study on habitat, diseases, effect of pregnancy. Government has to step forward and do something now. Noise, pollutions (mine has 1 000 000 L of diesel), greenhouse gases. Contamination in lichen. Reduce noise levels. Need more communication, and information in aboriginal language.	

Draft Proceedings Summary

**Bathurst Caribou Herd Community Meeting
Deh Gah Gotie First Nation
Fort Providence Metis Local
Fort Providence, NT
November 16, 2009**

10 community members attended

Opening Remarks: James Christie, representative of the Fort Providence Resource Management Board

- James commented 3 years ago the Fort Providence Resource Management Board became concerned about the declining numbers of the herd and decided it would be irresponsible to continue their community harvest. FPRMB did not seek publicity for this decision but should have.

Comments and questions following review of the June 2009 survey:

1. Question: what do you attribute the decline to?

ENR response: For the most part it is a natural cycle - poor conditions of animals; poor pregnancy rates; environment/climate. When the herd gets lower in numbers we have to be careful about other causes.

2. Comment: the increase in air traffic from 1985 to date over the caribou range may have contributed to the decline in numbers. And the footprint left from diamond mines and roads.

ENR response: From what we are seeing it does not have an impact on the population. It is a concern. There are other herds declining where there is no flight activity.

3. Question: Wondering if sports hunting has something to do with it? They tend to want trophy bulls and if they were left alone those were the ones that would be breeding and improving health of the herd.

ENR response: This is a concern that everyone shares. From ENR's side of things we survey in the fall and try to determine the number of bulls, etc. to use guidelines. We know the number of bulls. One thing we understand, if you keep removing prime bulls in a herd that is low in numbers it has to have an impact.

4. Comment: In reference to sound disturbance, in cold dense air you can hear a big truck 5 miles off the highway.

5. Comment: Over the last few years, there is a lot of water in the bush, more than before. Is there more water where the caribou are?

ENR response: It varies from time to time. We know animals are affected by insects. Causes disturbance and they can't breed. Snow composition seems to be changing and crystal air in the snow pack is not a good thing. Moisture level plays a role. There is correlation between water and vegetation.

6. Comment: The Bison herd is declining. People are saying there is too much water and the food is frozen under water.

ENR response: Have to find ways to allow more calves to get to the calving ground.

7. Question: Does the same thing happen to the reindeer?

ENR response: They don't keep track of the reindeer. They are free ranging. Not declining.

8. Question: How about the other side of the globe, like Russia, is it is the same situation as here?

ENR Response: Some of Alaska is recovering now. It is not as drastic as the Bathurst herd.

9. Question: Are we finding a lot of caribou are wounded and wonder off to die? Since the diamond mines coming there are a lot of vehicles. Are there inexperienced guys going out and killing them, wounding them?

ENR Response: Yes. We are trying to get a hunter education program delivered to some of the communities.

10. Question: Is anyone watching the wolves? As the Buffalo were increasing we noticed wolves have evolved. At the same time we are seeing a decline in moose in this area. Is someone monitoring the wolves?

ENR Response: When one goes down in numbers the other follows. ENR has been monitoring wolf dens for several years.

11. Question: Are there lots of bears in the calving grounds?

ENR Response: Usually see 10 to 12 on average. Have not seen more than 5 solves in the calving grounds.

12. Question: Is there any evidence of this happening in the past, decline and recovery?

ENR Response: Yes. Things have changed on us. We don't know if climate change will add to the problem. We need to adjust our hunting on the Bathurst herd until things get better.

13. Question: What are people going to do for food on the table?

ENR Response: Looking at diverting harvesting to another herd to the west or east.

Questions and comments following review of joint proposal:

1. Comment: Agree with reducing harvesting of all females.

ENR Response: Does not look like the Tlicho will agree with that. Limited female harvest may be possible, on other herds subject to other RRMB. ENR wants to go with no female harvesting.

2. Question: Would no female hunting be until the population goes up?

ENR Response: The area of concern is the winter roads. Proposal is to have hunting management or a 200 metre no hunting area from the winter roads.

3. Question: Will ENR be enforcing, e.g., hunting of bulls only?

ENR Response: Yes. There will be check stations. Will try to hire wildlife monitors from the Tlicho communities to assist with monitoring.

4. Question: Will there be fines?

ENR Response: There are fines under the Wildlife Act, for different offences.

5. Comment: 200 metres seems narrow.

ENR Response: ENR requested 2 – 4 km from each side of the road.

6. Question: What is going to replace the caribou?

ENR Response: We are trying to get ITI involved to help communities travel further to hunt neighbouring herds, and bison around the Tlicho communities. Get a zone opened with tags available. Another option is to utilize road kill.

7. Comment: Don't know how we will make our recommendations. Personally, some things to consider are:

- Try to determine why the reindeer numbers seem to not be affected by this decline and appear to be okay
- Should be limited cull on wolves, bears and other predators. A lot of them will starve anyway
- Fines for illegal hunting and wasting should be greatly increased
- People should be taught how to preserve meat from things like freezer burn and prevent wastage - hand out vacuum pack machines
- Road kill should be salvaged and distributed, wastage has to come to an end
- Hire people in town to utilize wastage
- Promote harvesting of other types of meat and fish

8. Question: Are you going to study areas that have been used for calving, after calving?

ENR Response: We are looking at doing that.

9. Comment: Bring resident hunting to zero. Greater monitoring on use of fast machines for hunting.

10. Question: Is there disease affecting the herds?

11. Question: Is there a chain of decline at the bottom of the animal chain?

ENR Response: Caribou down in numbers means wolves are down in numbers.

12. Comment: Stop it with government. Chicken shit MLA's won't stand up in the house. It is up to the government to stop it. If ENR or RCMP can't stop it call in the army.

13. Question: What are we going to do to replace meat, where is the meat going to come from?

ENR Response: Need to get ITI on board and involved. Put dollars on the table to assist communities and aboriginal people to replace loss of red meat. At the end of the day it is like James stated, up to the government to do something and that is why government is coming up with this action plan.

14. Comment: In addition to noise pollution, there are other things that come with that – mines burning fuel and greenhouse gas omissions in the area of the migration routes and calving grounds. In addition to that, truck hauling and flights. Need to look at contamination on the ground that is turning caribou off from eating or affecting their digestion.

15. Question: Are diamond mines conducting studies of impact on areas surrounding the mines?

16. Question: Did impact happen after the mine industry? Should there be a reduction in noise control – you could try that?

17. Comment: This type of information is good but has to get out more. Fort Providence RRMB quit paying for community hunts. If more people had this information they will start getting concerned and take action voluntarily, harvest less, report infractions. Get this out in all languages. There was a lot of bad publicity in the spring – if people had seen this data you would not have had that.

ENR Response: You are right, we should be saying it more.

18. Comment: Hire people to get the message out. Use media.

NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: November 25, 2009	TIME:
NAME: Betty Villebrun Arthur Beck Paul Harrington Lee Mandeville	COMPANY: NWT Metis Nation Fort Resolution Metis Council Hay River Metis Council North Arm Metis Council of Yellowknife
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Lance Schmidt	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the above companies in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATION: ENR did a presentation on survey methods and results that were gathered June 3-12, 2009. The purpose of the survey was to estimate the number of breeding females in the Bathurst Caribou herd on the calving grounds (1986-2009). In addition, there were calculations of breeding cows (minus detailed statistics), estimations of Bathurst Herd size from breeding female numbers, and the overall population size. The total herd size is based on photo census, which is based on breeding cows and the ratio of cow/calf and cow/bull.	
ACTIONS ITEMS/FOLLOW UPS:	

Draft Summary Bathurst Caribou Herd Community Meeting

**Northwest Territory Metis Nation (Betty Villebrun)
Fort Resolution Metis Council (Arthur Beck)
Hay River Metis Council (Paul Harrington)
North Arm Metis Council of Yellowknife (Lee Mandeville)
November 25, 2009**

Opening Discussion

Bruno Croft provided an overview of the presentation on the Bathurst Caribou Herd June 2009 Survey. He explained the purpose of this meeting is to see what you have not seen yet and to get your recommendations to add to the joint proposal to be brought to the Wekeezhii Renewable Resources Board prior to the public hearing.

Paul Harrington - asked why ENR is not just moving to do what you need to do instead of doing this consultation? In the meantime people are shooting caribou and game outfitters are still shooting. All direction I have heard and all aboriginal people I have been talking to say get it done. It took 3 years to talk to the Aboriginal groups. 11 recommendations were presented and ENR has only worked out one. Assemblies are saying get it done now.

ENR response - explained the numbers we got this summer in the survey are new numbers and compelling and we have no choice. We have legal obligation to consult.

Paul Harrington – I've been in negotiations for over 12 years and have always heard the Minister has veto.

ENR response - we were asked to do consultation on the joint proposal. The Minister has asked us to go one more time before the winter harvest, get one last shot at it to get everybody's input. He will go the distance.

Paul Harrington – I can understand why they want to put provisions into our land claims to guarantee us wildlife. The way our herds and animals are being managed is too slow. Reaction time to deal with an emergency is too slow.

ENR response – we have come up with a joint proposal and our Tlicho partners did not agree on some of the measures. We have got back to them and can go ahead with emergency measures. Wekeezhii Renewable Resources Board is waiting for this and then will make the last call.

Betty Villebrun – Northwest Territory Metis Nation sent a letter to the Minister saying we agreed we should not be hunting any caribou. As far as we can see we have done what we can do.

ENR – it is refreshing to get your recommendations and to hear you are not doing community hunts. I think what happened is if you go back 3 years, we got really slack on not doing consultation. I think you will find we are moving faster on this than anything else we have done. Within the next 3 weeks, before Christmas, you will hear things. The Minister we have now is not shy to do things. I think you will see things from him you have not seen from other Ministers.

Arthur Beck – a lot of people are aware of what is going on. Have been talking about this in my language and in English on the radio.

ENR - we are dealing with different herds. The one we are concerned about is the Bathurst herd.

Review of June 2009 Bathurst Caribou Herd Survey

Paul Harrington – would not want someone to see this and then say – well, look at all that caribou. Need to explain the information.

ENR – we are forced to defend this all the time.

20 people were involved in the survey, 2 aircraft and 2 choppers, a biologist, Aboriginal groups. One thing people have to understand is that when we do a calving ground photo census we are counting the number of females on the calving ground. We monitored the peak of the calving season, 4 to 5 days on either side.

Paul Harrington – surveys can be affected by things like weather

Arthur Beck – this stuff is not enough. If you come to our community you might as well do it right, bring the stuff you brought to the workshop in October – Danny Beaulieu's stuff. Bruno asked Arthur for a list of what information to bring to the community.

Paul – I'm hoping when the Minister does things to protect the caribou, that he is going to do it for all the herds. If we have to go through this for every herd we will have no caribou here in 10 years. When we talk about caribou we are talking about all the caribou

ENR – one of the recovery options include shutting down Bathurst harvesting and helping people to hunt other herds. Tlicho folks are telling us there is a problem, we want to do our part, but in order for us to do something there has to be a clear case of conservation. We don't want to say we will stop hunting. If it doesn't happen the Minister will make the call.

Paul Harrington – as soon as you have an Aboriginal group impose restrictions, the Minister has to step in.

ENR – think you will find the Minister has more guts than others.

Paul Harrington – from what I have seen the Aboriginal groups are meeting, recommendations are put forward, and here we are now. This is going to sit on the Minister's head if Aboriginal groups are deciding you are challenging our rights.

ENR – we are trying to find ways to accommodate Aboriginals. We have to find them something else to eat.

Arthur Beck – organize hunts by the bands in communities where they need meat. Explain to the First Nations you have an inherent right but they are no good if there are no caribou.

Betty Villebrun – don't think the white people have done that much damage.

ENR – harvesting by non-Aboriginals is not that high. If we are going to tap in Aboriginal rights other privileges have to go first.

Betty Villebrun– Aboriginal people have to understand if there is no meat ---

Paul Harrington – my recommendation is what people need to hear now is species at risk – start pushing that now. Don't wait till it is too late. If aboriginal groups are against that then we will see how government will manage our herds. If they can't do anything with that then we are in trouble with moose and all.

Paul Harrington – another thing that is confusing is the 3 years when the bells started going off and we saw the decline with no comeback, I always thought those 3 years and 11 recommendations was the consultation.

ENR – what happened there is going back to 2007 the Wekeezhii Renewable Resources Board said come up with a joint proposal. Then we got bogged down in the court case. When we came out of this in January this year our government was ready to go to business.

Arthur Beck – also at the first 2 sessions Aboriginal people wanted that information to be used as information for us, not call it consultation cause they didn't meet with the communities. Mine activity is missing from your presentation. It just touched on it. Not only January meeting steering away from it but the Tlicho government also steering away.

Comments Re Recovery

Arthur Beck – young breeders could be selected out. That is what we should be harvesting.

Lee Mandeville – outfitters will jump this, they are going after bulls with antlers. They will jump on us.

Arthur Beck – big game outfitters are killing big breeders. Maybe the little guys are doing the breeding and the fetus is not as healthy.

Paul Harrington – no good to take out the big bulls, they are the ones with the good genes. I always thought that Aboriginals would be the last ones hunting them.

Paul Harrington - why are they still commercial hunting?

ENR - there was pecking order, that in management of wildlife and birds, Aboriginals would be the last ones to have access. The first ones to go would be commercial hunters, then non status then Aboriginals.

Paul Harrington - It sounds like commercial is going to keep going regardless and we will be stopped at the same time. There should be room for these little communities to take a quota. Why should there continue to be commercial hunts and shut us off at the same time.

Lee Mandeville – why aren't they at the table? Why should they have a say – people from the states.

ENR – we have consulted a bit with outfitters. They are already selling tags. They have been told to be cautious about selling tags. That is the first step before regulation. It is very clear that if we are thinking about taping Aboriginal hunters the other ones are gone. We are at the point now where no choice.

Paul Harrington – I can understand where these communities are telling Chiefs my family is not going to have meat and still allow commercial hunting. Seems commercial people can take government to court but we can't.

ENR – in a joint proposal when we are infringing Aboriginal hunting, any harvesting will be by Aboriginal people.

Paul Harrington – you should make that clear from the start.

Paul Harrington - Finally got a look at the big picture. Metis hunt from all of the herds. When one herd is in trouble we know it is all the herds. Has to be massive coverage.

Arthur Beck – have to check the water, lichen takes 15 years to mature, so sulphur dioxide coming off trucks, that is what they are doing to the caribou.

ENR - we started collecting vegetation samples this year and will get results of that soon.

Arthur Beck – show your results to us. If you don't it is easy for us to say you are not showing it cause they have something to hide.

Paul Harrington – needs to be political will behind every movement. Saw caribou antlers in Nova Court – we haven't been hunting for 3 years already. We started 3 years ago taking it easy.

Arthur Beck – don't want to go back and talk about mistakes we made in the past. I want to go forward.

Lee Mandeville – need education for what you are showing.

Review of Joint Proposal

ENR - Wekeezhii Renewable Resources Board will not make a call until November. GNWT will take emergency measures.

Paul Harrington – commercial hunters should be on top.

Paul Harrington – we should be dealing with all herds.

Lee Mandeville – might be hard to get consensus, one formula for across the table.

ENR – we are suggesting Aboriginal people to continue to bring meat to the table from Bluenose West and Ahlak until we have a count this summer. No commercial meat tags, no outfitters tags, no resident hunting. Harvest adjacent herds. But Tlicho are saying no restriction to female harvesting.

Arthur Beck – don't mind for some communities to harvest caribou but leave breeding females alone.

ENR - most Tlicho Chiefs are in line but the problem is Wekweti, perhaps 2 Chiefs.

Paul Harrington – you are setting yourselves up for something else, you can't deal herd by herd. They are going to fly out and nail other herds. They have done it in the past. They will do it again. They have the money to do it. They will concentrate on this one herd, they have money and resources to fly out to hunt other herds.

Lee Mandeville – what about the moose population? If they start community hunts on moose?

ENR - will definitely put pressure on other species.

Paul Harrington – we noticed woodland are taking a hit. They are hunting them. We are looking at ways to put restrictions on that but we can't because the band is doing it.

The other thing is harvesting of trees in their calving grounds. Loggers harvest trees in their calving grounds and we are running into problems with that too.

If we only deal with one herd they are going to fly out and shoot the shit out of other herds.

RECOMMENDATIONS TO ENR

1. The way our herds and animals are being managed is too slow. Reaction time to deal with an emergency is too slow.
2. With reference to the June 2009 survey presentation – need to explain the information, people will see all the caribou shown on the grid and say there is lots of caribou.
3. When the Minister does things to protect the caribou, he should do it for all the herds. Has to be massive coverage.

4. Organize hunts by bands in the communities where they need meat. Explain to the First Nations you have an inherent right to hunt that is no good if there are no caribou. There should be room for little communities to take a quota.
5. People now need to hear species at risk – start pushing that now.
6. Need to hear about affects of mine activity.
7. Should be harvesting young bulls, leave females alone.
8. Not good to take out big bulls, they are the ones with good genes.
9. Make it clear from the start – when infringing Aboriginal hunting, any harvesting will be done by Aboriginal people. Commercial hunters on the top of no hunting.
10. Check the water and show results to us.
11. Need political will behind every movement.
12. Need public education about the 2009 survey and joint proposal.



NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: November 26, 2009	TIME:
NAME: Martin Knutson Mayor Gordon Van Tighem Karen McMaster	COMPANY: NWT Wildlife Federation
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Lance Schmidt	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the NWT Wildlife Federation in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATION: ENR did a presentation on survey methods and results that were gathered June 3-12, 2009. The purpose of the survey was to estimate the number of breeding females in the Bathurst Caribou herd on the calving grounds (1986-2009). In addition, there were calculations of breeding cows (minus detailed statistics), estimations of Bathurst Herd size from breeding female numbers, and the overall population size. The total herd size is based on photo census, which is based on breeding cows and the ratio of cow/calf and cow/bull.	
ACTIONS ITEMS/FOLLOW UPS:	

**Draft Summary
Bathurst Caribou Herd Meeting
NWT Wildlife Federation
November 26, 2009**

Martin Knutson, President, NWT Wildlife Federation
Mayor Gordon Van Tighem, City of Yellowknife, Federation Member
Karen McMaster, Consultant and Member, NWT Wildlife Federation

Gordon Van Tighem provided a short history of the NWT Wildlife Federation. Established as an issue reactive group in the NWT in the 1980s, and operated mostly south of the lake. Currently has 240 members from across the NWT and is affiliated with the Canadian Wildlife Federation.

ENR reviewed the June 2009 calving ground survey.

Federation – asked if there were caribou that were not collared calving in other areas.

ENR – when they go to the breeding ground they are breeding cows from a specific herd

Federation – How many collars would you have

ENR – no more than 20 in the Bathurst herd

Federation – is all calving and historical information on line, or available from the department

ENR – all published information is available online or archived

Federation – because there are a limited number of collars put out you could be missing other calving grounds

ENR – will address this with another slide

Federation – who were the 20 people involved in the survey

ENR – pilots, engineers, 4 Aboriginal groups representatives, GNWT biologists and community members

Federation – what was your budget

ENR - \$252,000

Federation – as a biologist how would you rate the data on a scale of 1 – 10

ENR – 8 out of 10

Federation – let's say this is good science. What I see now is good for me. There is a huge drop in numbers. We know a few things, the outfitters are taking, we have a strong estimate as to the resident hunt, what has caused this herd going from 200,000 to 16,000.

ENR presented the animated presentation.

Federation – what is definition of post calving

ENR – mostly 2 – 3 weeks after birth (June 24 to 28)

Federation – asked what the causes for decline are

ENR – predators, poor conditions of calving grounds, weather, poor condition of breeding cows

Federation – why is the Wekeezhii Renewable Resources Board making the decisions

ENR – Bathurst herd was traditionally in the Wekeezhii area

Continued discussion around make up of the WRRB and priorities set in the Tlicho land claim agreement

ENR suggested the NWT Wildlife Federation give a presentation to the WRRB

Federation – is it the government's position that there should be elimination of harvest on the Bathurst herd

ENR – we would say no harvesting

ENR – where it stands now is with the joint proposal

ENR – the Tlicho chiefs will come back next Friday with their thoughts on what they think about the options in the proposal and give us their recommendations

Federation – you are the scientists. We have spent millions on studies, now is the time to say shut it down or we will lose the species

ENR – government may take emergency measures

Federation – how did the joint proposal come about

ENR – the joint proposal to come up with recovery options was agreed to by government as a starting point to go to the board. There are only a couple of areas where we disagree, one of them is hunting of females

Federation – when you say no harvest of the Bathurst herd, how will they know it is a Bathurst caribou

ENR – no hunting zones where there are Bathurst – no hunting whatsoever where there is heavy overlap of herds

ENR – described management options set in 2007 and the court case bogging down the process until January 2009. As far as the Bathurst herd goes, we are ready to go to court if we have to, but need to hear more from everybody

ENR – WRRB will have to make the call. Someone will decide on the legal process. There is a pecking order that has to be followed

Federation - there is a management issue that has to fall on GNWT. This has been allowed to take place. GNWT has been responsible to manage wildlife and they haven't done it

Federation – we have to go back. I'll go to government as a whole, back to the 90's where the caribou budget was low. Government dropped the ball, did not have good science and the ball started to snowball

Federation – referred to overall government management of the resource and land claims agreements giving power of aboriginals in the science. The pieces of the puzzle are coming together to dictate the mess we are in

Federation (City of Yellowknife rep) – responsibilities occurred on the other side, sections of the land claim and reporting that has not been done for years

Federation – can't manage without data. We have to all work together if we want caribou – have a uniform system

Federation – if there is an allocation, if they get that far, and allocation goes to the First Nations they could decide how many caribou is really needed and allocate on that basis

ENR – everybody talks about things in the past but today this is where the caribou are. Let's make decisions from what we have today. We are getting support from the Aboriginal communities saying do something. The more comments we have is back up

Federation – we need to go away and come up with a position that we take to the public and to government, and discuss internally with government

Federation – seem to be pushing things through over the Christmas season

ENR – proposal suggests bison as an alternate food source

Federation – how can you make a decision on the caribou without a bison strategy, the two working together

Federation – due process here has been flawed and has to be addressed. As interveners we will bring up the due process. Karen as an intervener could talk to ENR about what they see as proper process, get feedback from ENR as to what would make sense as far as due process.

Federation – any talk about opening access to Buffalo

ENR – some communities are looking at other areas for alternate food sources, bison is one of them

Federation – will resident hunters be included

ENR – have to look at what is fair

Federation – support would be there for you if you include residents

Federation – hoping board comes back with positive management tools

Federation – what is the make up of the WRRB

ENR – 2 GNWT; 2 Federal government; 4 Tlicho

Federation – see that as being a critical component, imbalance. Suggested appointing Karen as a volunteer board member

Federation – will hold the board accountable for their actions

ENR presented the recovery graph and showed options for recovery of the herd

Federation – government needs to clarify rate of decline and definitions as shown on the chart

Federation – a lot of this started with past members of the caribou team, appeared to us they had a hidden agenda. Taste has been carried forward. I see people with a different appreciation and much better science. There are some things you are tarnished with from the past that has left a bad taste in people's mouths. Have to get over that and be proactive

ENR – explained disappointing results with using infrared to monitor caribou on the calving ground

Federation – closed by saying they will relay information to their members. Need to have an organized voice for them

ENR – if you want to have a public meeting on this we will do it

Federation – how do we keep abreast of new information, after the Tlicho come back

ENR – suggest you contact the Director's office and ask those questions

ENR – we have heard from the Minister that he is contemplating emergency measures

Federation – if you are eliminating hunting for one group, you have to eliminate for all groups

ENR – talked about options for getting meat for communities, funding community hunts in other areas

Federation – have a problem with using our tax dollars to fly people around to hunt (kill)

Recommendations to ENR:

1. We have spent millions on studies. Now is the time to say shut it down or we will lose the species.
2. Re data from GNWT and land claim groups, we have to all work together if we want caribou – have a uniform system.
3. If allocation of hunting goes to the First Nations they could decide how many caribou is really needed and allocate on that basis.
4. Federation needs to go away and come up with a position that we take to the public and to government, and discuss internally with government
5. Due process has been flawed and has to be addressed. The Federation, as an intervener, could talk to ENR about what they see as proper process, get feedback from ENR as to what would make sense as far as due process.
6. Suggested appointing a NWT Wildlife Federation representative to the WRRB.
7. In the past it appeared to us there was a hidden agenda. Have to get over that and be proactive.
8. If you are eliminating hunting for one group, you have to eliminate for all groups.

NORTH SLAVE REGION CONSULTATION LOG

DATE: November 30, 2009	TIME:
NAME:	COMPANY: Deline
	PROJECT: Bathurst Caribou
ENR REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT: Bruno Croft, Fred Mandeville, Dean Cluff	PROGRAM TIME FRAME:
NOTES: ENR requested a meeting with the people of Deline in order to discuss the decline of Bathurst Caribou and obtain guidance in managing the herd to assist in its recovery.	
ENR PRESENTATION: ENR did a presentation on survey methods and results that were gathered June 3-12, 2009. The purpose of the survey was to estimate the number of breeding females in the Bathurst Caribou herd on the calving grounds (1986-2009). In addition, there were calculations of breeding cows (minus detailed statistics), estimations of Bathurst Herd size from breeding female numbers, and the overall population size. The total herd size is based on photo sensus, which is based on breeding cows and the ratio of cow/calf and cow/bull.	
AUDIENCE COMMENTS: Do you have elders involved in the studies (people over 60)? The caribou have been here forever. It's hard to make judgment on animals. Once they disappear, they disappear- it's a fact. Don't play around with the animals. We will take what we need to survive, regardless of population. How much did you spend in the Sahtu region on caribou? We have been working with the GNWT for years to make a plan and nothing has happened. We would like to see the same amount of money spent on the Bluenose herd as others. The boards need to work together. The decline on the Bluenose East herd. Exploration, activity, caribou winter range. Different opinions on sharing. Some said yes, others said no. Don't understand why the Tli cho is not willing to have restrictions. Same issues as in Colville Lake. They keep killing everything.	

**Draft Summary
Bathurst Caribou Herd Meeting
Deline
November 30, 2009**

(25 people attended)

ENR staff:

Dean Cluff, Biologist, North Slave Regional Office

Fred J. Mandeville, Manager, Wildlife and Environment, North Slave Regional Office

Edward Reeves, Office Manager, SRRB, requested the Deline Renewable Resource Council be invited to future meetings re Caribou.

Edward Reeves, Office Manager, SRRB
(867) 589 8112 edward_reeves@gov.deline.ca

Dean Cluff said he would send maps to Edward Reeves.

Review of the caribou migration presentation.

ENR explained using radio collars on the different herds.

Bathurst caribou herd declined over the past several years and a lot in the last few years. If we don't do something about this we might not have Bathurst caribou in five or six years. Talked about pattern of decline and what we want to do about it.

Showed the collar locations map.

Talked about the Bluenose East counting at the calving grounds, June 2009 survey. Counted only breeding cows. There are a lot of collars on the Bluenose East herd. Did Bluenose East post calving ground count in 2005 and 2006. Tried again this year but could not get all caribou into a smaller area to count. Next year will do a calving census for the Bluenose East. Need right conditions for a post calving count. Tried to estimate the number of female breeding cows.

Showed map of photo census.

Caribou collars do a reasonable job of telling us when and where they get to the calving ground.

Have to fly a survey to be able to tell where the caribou are, before going to do photo census.

ENR - need input from you at these meetings. Although you may not harvest Bathurst, there are implications for the Bluenose East.

Information and results from these meetings will go to the Wekeezhii Renewable Resources Board before we make a decision.

Reviewed graph showing predictions for future of the Bathurst.

Discussion

Do you have input from elders on this study?

ENR – yes. We had people from the communities with us when doing the work.

When we say elders we are talking about elders 60 and over involved with the studies.

ENR – had elders at the camp and counting with us.

Caribou have been here for ever. It is hard to be in control of the animals, caribou especially. It is hard to make judgement on the animals themselves. Even though we can come up with ideas it probably won't help the problems. If they disappear or grow back in numbers that is it. As Aboriginal people we depend on wildlife. We don't play around. We take only what we need.

We know there is a problem with the herds today but to try to find answers would be next to impossible. No one knows what will happen at the end. As wildlife officers you know about the herds cause you fly around them. To fly around with the aircrafts you are probably scaring caribou. When we see caribou we just take the ones we want to take. Even though you spent \$350,000, it will be hard to find answers. We still need to talk about it.

ENR – we just want people to be aware.

Out of the \$350,000, how much was spent in the Sahtu?

ENR – I don't know.

Spent nothing on ours. Maybe these surveys should be done every year.

ENR – Would not be much change in one year.

We have to ask for extra funds to do surveys.

Nunavut will be paying for part of the Ahiak survey.

You will take action cause of the Tlicho. Deline has been working with ENR since our land claim in 1993. Our resolution from the AGM is different from the Tlicho. No action is taken or no commitment from the government. The Great Bear Lake management plan is just sitting there. All the words from the elders is in the management plan. No support came to us. We have constitutional rights here. I support this action but on the other hand we have been fighting for years and government won't support us to protect the Bluenose East and West. I want to know where this is going to go and why the Wekeezhii board has control over the Sahtu. You can't control the caribou. Since 1993 we say report our harvest of caribou. Tlicho and Dehcho have been harvesting our caribou for years and they don't report them. Resolutions for years to protect, preserve and save the habitat. No action has been taken until this.

ENR – think you will see a lot of action now. Have a strong Minister who wants to do the right thing. Input from this area will be considered. Presentation will be made to the Wekeezhii board and decisions will be made. Fred will show you the joint proposal for emergency measures.

Is the \$350,000 spent only for the South Slave?

ENR – that was for the Bathurst Caribou herd.

Would it be fair to say if you spend so much south of here we should target that. When you put a restriction on the Bathurst herd communications should be more open to each board. Like the community says I can't speak for Colville Lake but a herd is a herd. When you talk to elders, when you say caribou, that is one herd. Still if you want to be more consistent we should go to the calving grounds every year, not every 3 years. South budget one year, north budget the next. Work with Giwch'in area, all boards should come together. Not one herd, it is the whole herd.

ENR – focused in on Bathurst herd this last year but money spent on Bluenose East as well. Bluenose East has received lost of studying. Lot's of tracking. We are proposing to have calving and post calving surveys done next year for the Bluenose East herd.

The boards don't see eye to eye. All of a sudden Tlicho has to talk about our board but do not even visit us. Why work with one board when there are different boards. Why not put all the boards together. We have different boards. If you have people who have the right to harvest, if a resident has the right to hunt one caribou, there is an impact there. As aboriginal people we have the right to harvest. To include non-aboriginal is probably where the problem could be. A big argument about that. That is an issue that should be addressed. Non resident versus resident. Who is the money being spent for?

ENR – regarding surveying every year, that is expensive, but that is not the only reason. You would not see much difference in one year. Every 3 years is easier.

When I was in Yellowknife, the herd was in Sask and Man. There is no law set for bilateral agreements.

ENR – your suggestion about boards talking to each other is good.

If there is no law, you can't do anything. Tlicho and Gwich'in.

Talked about the wolves and grizzly.

Talked about the bounty on wolves.

We recommend government give \$120 for wolf pelts.

ENR – We also think wolves are declining too along with caribou.

Review of the Joint Proposal

Elder speaking: The caribou is here for food for everybody in the world. In the past there is a story when the wolves and caribou met. The same we are doing here, meeting to talk about caribou. There was a restriction put by the wolves saying the caribou can't go this way. The wolf would not let the caribou go where they wanted to. So elder wolf and elder caribou with wolves and caribou met. They told that wolf what you are thinking of doing you are probably right but for myself as caribou you as wolves should be happy we are around like humans.

Whoever eats meat they are thankful. Look at all the food available in this world. And all the human beings around the world and a lot of them depend on caribou for food. What he is suggesting we don't go travelling in other areas. As caribou we are not here to destroy or damage anything. Only to eat. That is why we travel so we can get at our food. And the same time the people also depend on us for food. That is what he said to the wolf. This is why Dene do not harm or damage anything. The wildlife that is around us in the world, our elders have always said don't play around with the wildlife, respect it. That has been passed on. That is why today we still have caribou. That is why us Dene people we are from a land that is cold. The cold weather like this the only thing available for us is caribou. The past 3 or 4 years a lot of changes have happened. Long time ago there was no interference with caribou. Not even government. The caribou were happiest in those days when nothing was interfering. They followed their migration route same as for years. Even though we were trained we were not trained as biologist officers. Because of development, interference, noise, pollution, looking for oil, gas and minerals the wildlife is disappearing. So you want to work on this proposal, there is other land claims beneficiaries around us. When we settled land claims we believed the reason was to help us and our land. We always said from the beginning if there was going to be a decline we would stop commercial harvesters. If it continues to decline us aboriginal harvesters to take action upon ourselves and our people. As elders we are aware of everything around us. We know caribou are coming close to us again. The reason they are coming back this way is developers are not developing as much as before. If you want to blame decline of caribou you can blame the developers. We are happy today we can still see wildlife on the land. This is just recently they have seen lots of signs of wildlife coming back. We had a meeting in Inuvik in October. We were talking about the Wildlife Act and they talked about the wolf. We know the impact the wolf has. If you put a carcass of caribou out in one night there would be nothing. Because less harvesting of wolves the population is growing enormously. So one of the recommendations maybe bounty price on wolves should go up so people will trap them. They made that recommendation but not have heard anything from the department, ENR. With this group here we are not sure if we can have impact on the proposal but we are here to listen.

ENR – we will bring those responses back to our department.

Review of proposed joint management proposal

Feedback re joint proposal.

The caribou herds are getting mixed up. Which herd is Bluenose East, Bathurst and Ahiak. Show the picture again.

The Bathurst herd that is coming into the Sahtu area, what will happen with the Bathurst herd. Will the Tlicho still have the right to harvest even though they are outside their territory. Caribou do mix, they go all over the place, so even though the herds mix together, the harvest should not be limited to anybody because they are mixing up. Tlicho can harvest herd in our area. We are not going to say you can't harvest in our area and Tlicho can't tell Sahtu not to harvest in their area. Would the proposal restrict people in the future?

ENR - trying to protect the Bathurst herd.

Once it is shut down, people will move on to our herd, it has to be fair. I mentioned there is a problem with the Bathurst because of the mining company. Talked about the disappearance of buffalo. We have a lot of mineral in our land, we are fighting back because of the caribou. There is something wrong. There is a big chunk of caribou missing that they are not saying

what happened. You can't blame wolves or the bear. It is from the south. Dogribs are trying hard but they are only looking at themselves. And they sell meat. And they are blaming this and that. It is nice if you talk to the natives here.

ENR – that is the reason why we are going to all the communities. Trying to find answers as to why caribou are disappearing. The more suggestions/solutions we have we can protect better.

Needs to be done for the whole region. Because they will move to the next herd. You should stop the whole thing. But that will be tough no one will come to feed me until caribou get back.

Since 1995 there were about 100,000 maybe 200,000. Since then has declined to about 60,000 maybe. We talked about it here in the community. We are concerned because the 25% decline is a lot. They wanted to get a committee going with the Inuit regarding protection of the calving ground. When they started migrating we wanted to monitor the harvesting. But biggest importance was the calving ground. The reason the Bathurst is declining is because of the many harvesters. We know Tlicho, because of their government, they have a RRB board working with ENR. When you say other organizations that would include us in the Sahtu, and other unsettled land claim groups? So one of the biggest most important issues is protection of the calving grounds. And maybe mobile protection.

Did you talk to Wrigley? Talk to Dehcho too about it. They are over our boundary.

If there is easier access to caribou there should be tougher laws for those with easier access. We have to go by skidoo. It is no use blaming people. And monitors out there. Should be teaching requirements. This will be in the wildlife act the elders talked about in Inuvik last month. Check stops.

Was amazed when I saw Tlicho do not want restrictions. They need to put restrictions.

Talked about other sources of food like musk ox.

Did not know about tags being lifted. Should be stricter laws. If you tell people here in Deline their herd is small they would probably abide by it.

We need to monitor – individuals harvesting.

Elders are saying you need to save the bulls, not the females.

Go next door to hunt. Have to put stricter laws.

ENR – regarding access, in the proposal there will be restrictions about hunting on the winter road. Education is one of the big pushes. Also, with our current ADM and DM they are strong supporters of community based monitors .

Issue of caribou have been around for centuries. There is a story about these caribou. It was talked about by our ancestors. About this time of the year the caribou come around. They live and graze around here all winter. They travel around for their food. That is what the elders have always said. In the following year around April they start going back to their calving grounds. Once they get back to their calving grounds only 1 calf gets born, sometimes 2. Rarely see 3 calves born at once. Around 1983 to 1985 the caribou herd from the Inuvik area came through here crossing the Bear River going toward the Dogrib area and Dehcho region.

This is the woodland caribou. Different from barren land. This is what the elders said. There were 3 unborn calves in this cow. When something like that happens, 3 unborn calves, it is a sign. This story came out when he was cooking for these elders. After they finished eating asked the elders what is the sign when you come across a cow with 3 unborn calves. Even my father's father said it is common there would be 1 or 2 calves. Caribou mostly 1 or 2 calves. Raymond's dad said the old man was happy. We haven't had that much caribou around us all these years and to hear the story of 3 calves is a good sign. Means there will be lots of caribou this coming year. The story was told by the elder. Elders are aware of things. When they went north they noticed the Ptarmigan were fat. When the Ptarmigan is fat, it is not right, so we have to go back. From then on there were hardly any caribou or moose. Sometimes caribou disappear and come back in numbers. So by the elders stories elders knew this is how the caribou move and how they act. Because they didn't believe us, they collared the caribou. Maybe we should stop pestering these caribou. Maybe we should stop bothering them. It is like you are disrespecting the caribou. I went to visit the city of Toronto and saw caribou at the zoo. They looked so pitiful. Caribou have their own mind they do what they were taught. They travel, they go where they want. We don't control where they go. But there is so much interference today, development, winter roads, commercial outfitters, harvesters. They hunt for the antlers only. And wolves are also a factor. Bears are also a problem. Caribou make their own laws. That is why you have to respect them. I would like to contribute the story of how caribou make their own law. The reason there are caribou here today is because of the male caribou. Outfitters are only hunting male caribou. Male caribou are the reason calves are being born. So by right the male caribou, bull caribou, is the one we should be protecting. Talking about caribou today we can't tell the caribou what to do or where to go. As people from north, Inuit, Dogrib, Sahtu people, we should gather in one place to come up with something for the caribou. And recommendations we come out with as a whole group Everybody as a group should come together and talk about the caribou. Have you ever heard the story about the caribou having 3 calves. This should be included in your study. This has to do with the decline and growth of the herds. We just want to work together fairly. There is still more to discuss and talk about.

Recommendations

1. Caribou surveys should be done every year.
2. When you put a restriction on the Bathurst herd communications should be more open to each board. If you want to blame decline of caribou you can blame the developers.
3. One of the recommendations may be bounty price on wolves should go up so people will trap them.
4. Caribou do mix, they go all over the place, so even though the herds mix together, the harvest should not be limited to anybody because they are mixing up.
5. Tlicho can harvest herd in our area. We are not going to say you can't harvest in our area and Tlicho can't tell Sahtu not to harvest in their area.
6. Needs to be done for the whole region. Because they will move to the next herd. You should stop the whole thing.
7. So one of the biggest most important issue is protection of the calving grounds. And maybe mobile protection.
8. If there is easier access to caribou there should be tougher laws for those with easier access. We have to go by skidoo. It is no use blaming people. And monitors out there. Should be teaching requirements. This will be in the wildlife act the elders talked about in Inuvik last month. Check stops.
9. We need to monitor – individuals harvesting.

10. Elders are saying you need to save the bulls, not the females.
11. So by the elders' stories elders knew this is how the caribou move and how they act. Because they didn't believe us, they collared the caribou. Maybe we should stop pestering these caribou.
12. Male caribou are the reason calves are being born. So by right the male caribou, bull caribou, is the one we should be protecting.
13. As people from north, Inuit, Dogrib, Sahtu people, we should gather in one place to come up with something for the caribou. And recommendations we come out with as a whole group. Everybody as a group should come together and talk about the caribou.
14. Have you ever heard the story about the caribou having 3 calves. This should be included in your study.